

TITLE: Asymmetries between wh-extraction and Right-node Raising in Tagalog: A reply to Sabbagh 2008

Sabbagh 2008 claims that Right-node Raising (RNR) involves rightward movement in the same sense that wh-extraction involves leftward movement. He does this by showing an instance of symmetry in the type of element that can move in both cases: Only absolutive-marked subjects and oblique-marked elements can move (1,2). In this talk I show that this symmetry between wh-extraction and RNR does not hold and that many more constituent types can be ‘right-node raised’ than can be extracted. For example, ergative-elements can be ‘right-node raised’ (3) as well as larger constituents such as applicative phrases (4). I also show that the ostensibly moved constituent in RNR does not show the expected c-command effects vis a vis anaphora binding (5), casting further doubt on the movement analysis.

- (1) a. Sino ang nag-nakaw ng kotse mo?
 Who S ACT.PERF.steal NS car you(NS)
 ‘Who stole your car?’ (Rackowski 2002)
- b. *Sino ang n-in-akaw ang kotse mo?
 Who S PASS.PERF.steal S car you(NS)
 (‘Who stole your car?’) (Rackowski 2002)
- c. Sa ali-ng kalabaw i-binigay ng lalaki ang bulaklak?
 OBL which-L water-buffalo AGR-ASP.give NS man S flower
 ‘To which water buffalo did the man give the flower?’
 (Rackowski & Richards 2005)
- (2) a. [Hindi n-agluto’ ng bigas _] at [hindi kumain ng isda _]
 not AGR.ASP.cook NS rice and not AGR.ASP.ate NS fish
 ang pareho-ng babae.
 S same L woman
 ‘The same woman did not cook rice and did not eat fish.’ (Sabbagh 2008)
- b. *[N-anghuhuli ang ama ko _] at [n-agtitinda ang ina ko _]
 AGR.ASP.catch S father my(NS) and AGR.ASP.sell S mother my(NS)
 ng isda.
 NS fish
 ‘My father catches, and my mother sells—fish.’ (Kroeger 1993)
- c. [Linuto-’ ni Pedro ang pagkain _] at [hinugas-an ni Juan
 ASP.buy-AGR NS Pedro S food and ASP.wash-AGR NS Juan
 ang mga pinggan _] para kay Maria.
 S PL dish for OBL Maria
 ‘Pedro bought the food, and Juan washed the dishes—for Maria.’
 (Sabbagh 2008)

- (3) Sino ang nanghuli at sino ang nagtinda [ng isda]?
 Who Abs caught and who Abs sold erg fish
 “Who caught, and who sold, the fish?”
- (4) Linuto’ ni Pedro, at hinugas-an ni Juan, [ang pagkain para kay Maria].
 Cooked Erg Pedro, and washed Erg Juan Abs food for Obl Maria
 Pedro cooked, and Juan washed, the food for Maria
- (5) a. Pinigil ng lalaki ang sariliniya.
 Tr.Perf-control Erg man Abs self=3s.Gen
 “The man controlled himself.” (Aldridge 2006)
- b. *Pinigil ng sariliniya ang lalaki
 Tr.Perf-control Erg self=3s.Gen Abs man (Aldridge 2006)
- c. Pinigil ng lalaki at nasuntok ng bata [ang sariliniya].
 Controlled Erg man and hit Erg boy abs self=3s.Gen
 “The man controlled, and the boy hit, himself”

Aldridge, Edith. 2006. *The Heterogeneity of VOS and Extraction in Austronesian Languages*. Ms., Northwestern University.

Kroeger, Paul. 1993. *Phrase structure and grammatical relations in Tagalog*. Stanford: CSLI Publications

Rackowski, Andrea. 2002. *The structure of Tagalog: Specificity, voice, and the distribution of arguments*. Unpublished PhD dissertation, MIT. Cambridge, Mass.

Rackowski, Andrea. and N. Richards. 2003. *Phase edge and extraction: A Tagalog case study*. Ms., MIT

Sabbagh, Joey. 2008. *Right Node Raising and Extraction in Tagalog*. Linguistic Inquiry Volume 39, Number 3. MIT Press